

11 Church Street, Part lots 1043, 1044, and 1045 (vs. 1047), Part 3, Plan 28R1096, Town of Gananoque, Plan 86 West, County of Leeds, frontage 70.75, depth 104.00

PROPOSED REVISED BY-LAW STATEMENT

11 Church Street, Gananoque is a relatively simple, vernacular, single-family residential structure built of wood frame and cladding, dating from ca. 1865. It is ornamented with a storm porch protecting the front entrance that is in the Italianate style. Much of Church Street was developed in the third quarter of the 19th century, and the structure is in keeping with these properties and overall environment. It was likely built for Robert Brough, a prominent citizen and designer/creator of several properties in Gananoque as a development property, but not as his residence. In 1890 it became the residence of Emerson G. and Edith Maggie (née McFarlane) Hart, editor and publisher of the *Gananoque Journal*, and it remained in the Hart family until ca. 1913. The entirety of the rear parcel of the property (Part 1, R-470, Part 3 R-1096), is part of a former burial ground. This may include only a small portion of the front parcel on which the house sits (Lot 1043, D1026200). It is not a landmark, but the former burial ground status may need further examination which is addressed under another process.

The property qualified for designation under its earlier designation under the Ontario Heritage Act, and for historical, architectural and contextual criteria under the current criteria.

HERITAGE DESIGNATION BY-LAW 92-40

HERITAGE ANALYSIS REPORT: REAPPRAISAL, by Edgar Tumak Heritage, 2021, Architectural Historian, MSc Architecture, CAHP



Figure 1: Front elevation, 11 Church Street, Gananoque, viewed from the west (E. Tumak, Nov. 2020).

FOREWORD

As part of the heritage designation by-law update for 145 Stone Street South, Gananoque, a more extensive research report has been prepared to augment the supporting historical information of the original by-law. In this manner it was possible to fully respond to the Ontario Heritage Act (Ont. Reg. 9/06) criteria required by the review, as well as the list of heritage attributes. The original supporting information correctly identified that the property was appropriate for heritage designation, however, there was limited analysis of its architectural significance (other than a recording of its existing features), and no analysis of its historical context and environmental/contextual significance,¹ which are all part of the three main categories under Ont. Reg. 9/06. These have been addressed in the augmented historical analysis which supports the Ont. Reg. 9/06 criteria required by the review, as well as the list of heritage attributes.

¹ MacLennan Associates Architects, "Architectural Description for Historic Designation Purposes: 11 Church Street, Gananoque, County Leeds & Grenville, Ont.," October 22, 1992.

INTRODUCTION

11 Church Street is a relatively simple, vernacular, single-family residential structure built of wood, dating from ca. 1865. It is ornamented with a storm porch protecting the front entrance that is in the Italianate style. Much of Church Street was developed in the third quarter of the 19th century. The structure was likely built for Robert Brough as a development property, not as his residence.² In 1890 it became the residence of Emerson G. and Edith Maggie (née McFarlane) Hart, editor and publisher of the *Gananoque Journal*. The entirety of the rear parcel of the property (Part 1, R-470, Part 3 R-1096), is part of a former burial ground. This does not seem to include the front parcel on which the house sits (Lot 1043, D1026200).



Figure 2: Property boundary of 11 Church Street, Gananoque, outlined in red. The rear portion (furthest from Church Street) is the portion contained in the broader parameters of the former burial ground (<https://www.onland.ca/ui/28/books/55093/viewer/699076608?page=189>, Google 2021, provided by the Town of Gananoque).

HISTORY

Historical Associations

11 Church Street reflects the mid-19th century development of the high ground on the west side of the Gananoque River, particularly around Church, Princess and King streets, as a residential area of people of means from the industrial, mercantile and professional domains.

² Obituary of Robert Brough, *Gananoque Reporter*, 23 May 1903.

The development of the area as a prestigious enclave was reinforced by the erection in 1857-58 of the English Church (now the Anglican Church of Canada), often considered the 'society' or 'establishment' church in Canada (designated Pt. IV, 15 December 2009, by-law 2009-64). Churches, in particular a stone or brick structure, were one of the best ways to improve property values of a neighbourhood in mid-19th century Upper Canada, or to help create a neighbourhood. Further, these properties were in close proximity to the west shore of the mouth of the Gananoque River and its riverine power source that generated the income – directly or indirectly – for the households in these comfortable to grand residences, while also offering a close proximity to the mills for ready supervision or related employment.

The construction of Christ Church was preceded by Beaumont House at the southern terminus of Church Street erected a few years before, making the Beaumont residence one of the oldest, if not oldest structure on the street. The original iteration of Beaumont House conforms to what now has the civic address of 70 Church Street, while the later attached west portion (with the separate civic address of 72 Church Street) is likely from ca. 1900. The Beaumonts were an early successful family that was not a direct line with the Stone-McDonald clan – the founding settler family of Gananoque. As neighbours and adherents of the English Church, the Beaumonts made their home available for the reception that followed the opening of Christ Church.³ Another early structure in the immediate area, is the first rectory for Christ Church which was constructed immediately to the east of the church on Princess Street (no. 40).



Figure 5: 70 Church Street, Beaumont Residence, built ca. mid-1850s, viewed from the east ca. 1900 with an adjoining component of what became 72 Church Street under construction on the far right/west. As seen below, the residence features windows with a triangulated top similar to Christ Church (image provided by the owner of 72 Church Street, source unknown).

³ Newspaper clippings provided by current owner, n.d., n.s.



Figure 6: 70 Church Street viewed from the north, showing the triangular topped upper level window just right of centre (Edgar Tumak, April 2021).



Figure 7: 72 Church Street viewed from the north, with the adjoining 70 Church Street on the left (Edgar Tumak, April 2021).



Figure 8: 40 Princess St., the first Christ Church Rectory, viewed from the northeast, built after the first phase of Christ Church 1857-58, enlarged at the rear late 1910s. It is an example of what is often called an Ontario cottage form with embellishments in the Regency style (1830-60) for the door surround and a triangular topped central upper window in a Gothic Revival style mode in keeping with most of the windows of the associated Christ Church (photo E. Tumak, July 2009).

The land on which 11 Church Street sits was formerly part of the 1797 Crown land grant to Joel Stone, the founder of Gananoque. In 1853 it became the property of his grandson, William Stone McDonald. Abstracts of deeds and mortgaging, along with 1850s maps of Gananoque, do not substantiate the presence of a structure at what is now 11 Church Street prior to the mid-1860s. However, a bit north, near what became the northeast side of Church Street, was a church shared by several denominations.⁴ These were often called union churches, where different Christian sects worshipped at different times in the shared accommodation until the respective congregation had the means to construct their own dedicated worship space. The footprint of 11 Church Street (conforming to lot 1043) sits north of the former cemetery associated with that worship space (see Figures 9-11).

⁴ Ina G. Scott, *Yesterday's News, Today's History* (Gananoque: 1000 Islands Publishers Ltd., 1982), p. 49-50.



Figure 10: Detail of a plan of Gananoque, dated 1858, but likely composed earlier as not only is Church Street unnamed, but it does not conform to its current southerly alignment with Tanner Street. Further, structures that existed at the time are not shown (e.g., Christ Church, and the Beaumont residence). However, the location of the "Grave Yard" on which 11 Church Street sits (upper left corner), and a church and school at the juncture of King Street, opposite Tanner, are shown. (Library and National Archives of Canada Source link: <https://www.bac-lac.gc.ca/eng/CollectionSearch/Pages/record.aspx?app=FonAndCol&IdNumber=4134683>).



Figure 11: Detail of development Plan 86, showing the “Old Burying Ground” in the lower centre, and the overlap of the cemetery with lot 1043 (Map of the Incorporated Town of Gananoque in the Township and County of Leeds, Ontario, 1885, original displayed in the Planning Dept., Town of Gananoque, 2020).

The ca. 1865 date of construction of 11 Church Street, is supported by title record entries of a larger transfer of land from William Macdonald [sic.] to Alexander Campbell with a large mortgage. The form of the house is also in accord with the mid-1860s.

In 1871 the land relating to the Old Burial Ground on which 11 Church Street sits was gifted by Robert and Margaret Brough “to Queen Victoria”, i.e., the Crown, (That Pt. comprised in old burial ground. See Deane Plan 111). Some of the bodies were exhumed and re-interred to Willowbank Cemetery west of town, such as those of the McDonalds/Macdonalds. In 1939 the gifted land was leased by the Crown to Katherine F. Runyon, for the consideration \$15 yearly, for a term of 21 years (parcel known as old burial ground & R. of W. on pt. of this lot as in 108-H.w.o.l.). It appears that in 1955, with consent of the Treasurer of Ontario the lease was cancelled in the resolution of the estate of subsequent owner Mary Hannah Cooper (Part of lot as in 6372-12, w.o.l.).

Properties from the third quarter of the 19th century on Church, Princess and King streets illustrate the development of which 11 Church Street was part, although it was neither the earliest or grandest of houses constructed in this area at the time or shortly thereafter (see Figures 12-19).



Figure 12: 30 Church Street, Christ Church, viewed from the east, with the nave (1857-58) on the south/left, tower and spire in the centre (spire completed 1880), and the parish hall on the north/right (1901), built in the Gothic Revival style but with most window heads unusually featuring a triangulated top rather than a curved pointed arch (photo E. Tumak, Oct. 2009).



Figure 13: 75 King Street West, viewed from the northeast, originally the residence of Captain Chrysler, 1826, it was substantially modified in the 1870s⁵ with notable additions from this later time being the corner pavilion with its wide windows and the bell cast mansard roof (E. Tumak, July 2019).



Figure 14: 181 King St. W, Gananoque, with the earlier section on the left with the entrance surround in the Neoclassical manner, and a later wing at the right/west with a Mansard type roof (photo E. Tumak, July 2009).

⁵ Town of Gananoque, Heritage Self-Guided Walking Tour, n.d., active 2019.



Figure 15: 22 Church Street, in the Italian Villa style, viewed from the northeast (E. Tumak, July 2019).



Figure 16: 40 Church Street, viewed from the east, showing Italianate references (paired eave brackets and segmental window arches) and Queen Anne Revival style projecting bay on the south (left) topped by a pointed arch window at the third level window (E. Tumak, July 2019).



Figure 17: 250 King Street West, originally Woodview Villa, 1874-77, in the High Victorian style, viewed from the south, with motel units from the 1950s on the right (E. Tumak, July 2019).



Figure 18: 279 King Street West, viewed from the northwest, former Samuel McCammon residence, 1872, in the Italian Villa style (photo E. Tumak, Jan., 2008).



Figure 19: 16 Princess Street, second Christ Church Rectory, ca. 1900, viewed from the southeast (E. Tumak, Sept. 2019).

Person/Event

A notable occupant of 11 Church was Emmerson G. Hart, the publisher and editor of the *Gananoque Journal*. According to N.W. Ayer & Son's American Newspaper Annual of 1889, the paper was established in 1883 and described as a local weekly publication released on Fridays. It was generally eight pages, with a circulation of 1000 and a subscription cost of \$1.

On 23 May 1885, the *Gananoque Reporter*, communicated that on the previous Monday the wife of Mr. Hart, passed away, after a long period of suffering. Then on 3 April 1886, the *Reporter* published that Mr. Hart, remarried, at Montreal, Miss Edith Maggie Macfarlane, daughter of the late Mr. W.S. Macfarlane, in the St. James Street Methodist Church. In keeping with a society wedding there were extensive details: the bride was led to the altar by her grandfather, the Hon. Senator Ferrier; the fabrics of the bride's dress (ivory satin, trimmed with oriental lace, bridal lace and orange blossoms; the bridesmaid's dresses (cream silk jersey cloth with pearl trimmings to match), and that the groom and his attendants were attired in full evening dress as the wedding occurred at half-past six o'clock). After the ceremony the bridal party repaired to the residence of Senator Ferrier where a reception was held. It was noted that the presents were numerous and costly, and the happy pair left by the 8:55 train for an extended tour in the west.

Hart and his second wife acquired 11 Church Street in 1890 from businessman Charles E. Britton and wife (although the latter two are not believed to have lived in the building). While Hart retained

ownership of the property until 1913,⁶ he may not have resided there long as on 18 February 1899, the *Gananoque Reporter*, gave an obituary notice that on the previous Sunday the second Mrs. Hart died suddenly at their home in Montreal. She was 36 years of age. The couple had two young sons.⁷

ARCHITECTURE

Design



Figure 20: 11 Church Street, Gananoque, viewed from the northwest (E. Tumak, Nov. 2020).

⁶ <https://www.onland.ca/ui/28/books/55093/viewer/699076608?page=193> , lots 1043, 1044, 1045.

⁷ Issues of the *Gananoque Journal* could not be located to provide coverage by the *Journal*.



Figure 21: 11 Church Street, Gananoque, viewed from the southwest (E. Tumak, Nov. 2020).

11 Church Street is a front gable composition, clad with shiplap siding, with the interior organised on a side hall plan. Although all openings on the front elevation align vertically, the elevation is slightly asymmetrical with the south and middle openings closer together than the middle and north windows. The storm porch protecting the front entrance enriches the composition with its curved window heads, and more elaborate detailing than the main building.

The north/side elevation has only modest fenestration located towards the rear, and the south elevation is blind. The north elevation shows the slope of the property that descends almost a full storey from street (west) to the rear (east), and reveals a roughly coursed stone foundation.

The wing in the back housed the original servant area over a basement kitchen with separate interior stair access to the main building.⁸ This division of space was considered appropriate at the time for the class separation of family and servants. A basement kitchen was still popular in the third quarter of the 19th century as during the cold weather it provided heat to the levels above from the ever-burning wood-fired cooking options (stoves and/or fireplaces), and the stone foundations provided a cooling effect in the summer.

Style

11 Church Street is a vernacular composition from the third quarter of the 19th century and has no substantive stylar pretension.⁹ The front storm porch with its curved window heads and greater elaboration than the main building, shows Italianate influences, and may be of the 1870s-80s

Architect / Designer / Builder

120 King Street West was likely designed by and built for Robert Brough (b. Scone, Scotland 1822; d. Gananoque 1903) as either a development property, but not as his home, as his long-time residence was nearby on Market Street close to the St. Lawrence River.¹⁰ A title search notes him as having purchased it from William McDonald.

As an indication of his prominence, the newspaper coverage of his death in 1903 was much more than a standard obituary. He was described as “one of the oldest and best known citizens and town officials.” The *Gananoque Reporter* went on to say that he “busied himself by erecting dwelling houses. ... He had considerable talent as an architect, and many excellent buildings were erected from his plans.” It is unlikely that the term architect used in the newspaper is indicative of Brough having architectural training, but more that he was just a good self-taught designer of buildings for his own projects.

In 1839 Brough’s family emigrated to what became Canada, and located at Brockville, where he lived till 1846. There he learned the trade of wood turning. After relocating to Gananoque, he acquired water power rights and erected a stone factory on the east side of the Gananoque River. The mill made hay rakes, wheelheads and spinning equipment. Later he became a partner of S. Skinner a prominent

⁸ The author was not provided access to the interior or received response to enquiries from the owners. Interior analysis that affects the exterior designation comes from the original heritage designation report of MacLennan Associates Architects, “Architectural Description for Historic Designation Purposes: 11 Church Street, Gananoque, County Leeds & Grenville, Ont.”, October 22, 1992.

⁹ This contradicts the earlier designation report which gave unsubstantiated Regency and Greek Revival stylistic associations (MacLennan Associates Architects, “Architectural Description for Historic Designation Purposes: 11 Church Street, Gananoque, County Leeds & Grenville, Ont.”, October 22, 1992).

¹⁰ Obituary of Robert Brough, *Gananoque Reporter*, 23 May 1903.

Gananoque industrialist.¹¹ After his numerous industrial activities Brough also became involved with civic matters. He was prominent in the establishment of a rail line linking Gananoque with the national line (The Grand Trunk) in 1882-83.¹² He was also on village Council (prior to Gananoque becoming a Town in 1890), a Justice of the Peace, on the Board of License Commissioners, Director of both Township and County Agricultural Societies, and a Director of the Gananoque Horticultural Society which, prior to the 1920 incarnation of the current Horticultural Society, focussed on agricultural production. Brough took great pleasure in his garden and his extensive library.

At the time of his death he was Town Treasurer (a position he held for 15 years), and had his office in the Turner block, wherein town hall was located at the time. On the day of his death he had a weak spell at his office and asked that his son-in-law Dr. Rogers be notified (who lived and worked nearby at 161 King Street East, see designation report 2005-64, revised 2020). Another son-in-law, Mr. Sidney Adams had a store close by.

The funeral was attended by the Mayor and Councillors, town officials, and constables in uniform marched each side of the hearse to Willow Bank Cemetery. As Mr. Brough was formerly a member of the Board of Education, flags at the different school houses were lowered. Brough was survived by his wife Margaret (née) Ferguson.

ENVIRONMENT

Compatibility with Heritage Environs

Constructed ca. 1865, 11 Church Street is in keeping with the streetscape of Church Street as well as the mid to late-19th century development of the area along Church, Princess and King streets, which features structures of moderate proportions, mixed with power houses with more commanding setback siting.

Community Context / Landmark Status

From the street, the house at 11 Church Street occupies what appears to be a relatively standard rectangular town lot pattern that is narrower at the front and extends to a greater depth towards the rear, which is typical of other residential lots on the street. However, at the rear the broader property is irregularly shaped. At the southeast rear corner the front land parcel on which the house sits is joined perpendicularly by a roughly rectangular parcel of land of equal size. This latter portion leading to Market Street to the east, is located mid-block, and is not visible from the street due to the drop in terrain and resultant deviation from a standard grid pattern.

However, with the irregularity of the broader rear property not visible from Church Street, 11 Church Street blends in well with its neighbours and environs in terms of land use and property division.

¹¹ For further information on S. Skinner, see heritage designation report by E. Tumak, 95 King Street West, Gananoque, Ontario, 2008, revised 2020.

¹² Douglas N.W. Smith, *By Rail, Road and Water to Gananoque* (Ottawa: Trackside Canada, 1995), p 25.

As a structure it does not have landmark qualities. However, the property with its former “Old Burying Ground” status, and perhaps other features, likely has archaeological significance and hence unacknowledged landmark status.

HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES OF 11 CHURCH STREET, GANANOQUE

- Front gable form with rectangular fenestration
- Wood shiplap siding
- Side hall plan
- Storm porch protecting the front entrance with round-headed windows and detailing in keeping with the Italianate style

ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT, ONTARIO REGULATION 9/06, CRITERIA FOR DETERMINING CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST

1. (1) The criteria set out in subsection (2) are prescribed for the purposes of clause 29 (1) (a) of the Act. O. Reg. 9/06, s. 1 (1).

(2) A property may be designated under section 29 of the Act if it meets one or more of the following criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest:

Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest	Summary Analysis and Conclusion	Meets Criteria (Yes/No)
<i>1. The property has design value or physical value because it,</i>		
i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,	As a relatively standard front gable form of the mid-19 th century, 11 Church Street is a representative example of this basic form, distinguished by a vernacular interpretation of the Italianate style with the front storm porch protecting the front/main entrance.	Yes
ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or	120 King Street East does not display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.	No
iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.	120 King Street West does not display and technical or scientific achievements in its construction or form.	No
<i>2. The property has historical value or associative value because it,</i>		
i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,	11 Church Street is directly associated with Emerson Hart, the publisher-editor of the <i>Gananoque Journal</i> .	Yes
ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or	The property illustrates the development of Church Street and the surrounding area on the height of land on the west side of the Gananoque River, as an enclave of the prosperous and well-to-do associated with Christ Church then known as the establishment English Church (now the Anglican Church of Canada).	Yes

	The property includes a former burial ground and perhaps other features and, as such, has broader significance to the community which requires addressment through another process.	
iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.	The designer of 11 Church Street is likely Robert Brough who designed a number of structures in Gananoque as a self-trained amateur designer, as well as a person who was prominent in industrial and diverse civic activities in town.	Yes
<i>3. The property has contextual value because it,</i>		
i. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area,	11 Church Street is in keeping with neighbouring mid- to late-19 th residences along Church Street and the area that includes nearby properties along King Street West and Princess Street.	Yes
ii. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or	11 Church Street was erected shortly after the initial creation and development of the street in the mid-19 th century.	Yes
iii. is a landmark.	11 Church Street is not a landmark. It agrees with its neighbours in scale and form, but is easy to pass by without noticing.	No